| **Student Name:** Wendy Zhang |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  We should start with a hook rather than repeating the motion! We can use the same focus on development and well rounded growth, rather than first saying the motion and then saying this. We need to start strong.  Good comparison to standardised testing from the get go. We should try to present this comparison within set-up, where we explain what we support versus what the other side must support. We should unpack very clearly in set-up what the status quo is and how our world differs. We should also highlight what the problem with ST is - and what school looks like right now. How does holistic learning change the way school and classes and even college applications are centred.  Argument 1   * Good on pressure. Can we explain in detail how schools have amped up the pressure? * Good on less stress and more support; we should explain how this is what the point of school is. Should we stress kids out, or help them grow? * We want to compare this to ST; holistic learning emphasises deep understanding and application of knowledge, fostering a lifelong love of learning. Standardised testing, with its focus on rote memorization, often leads to superficial understanding and quick forgetting after the test. Holistic approaches encourage exploration, inquiry-based learning, and project-based learning, leading to more meaningful and lasting learning experiences. This isn’t just about the increase in subjects, but also the methodology of teaching. * What is the impact of this argument?   Argument 2   * Good on real life skills. Why is this exclusive? For instance, why can’t this be achieved through hobbies or extracurriculars? * Can we explain how they learn these better, or in more detail compared to the status quo? * Good work explaining how different kids have different needs, and that this system meets more students' needs.   We tend to read from our notes pretty extensively. Let’s try to make more eye contact and speak with confidence next time!  04:28 - let’s push ourselves to hit 5 next time! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Alissa Mak |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good opening challenging their framing of ST; let’s point to real life examples of why what we are saying is true right away. For instance, GCSE or IB offer Art, Film Studies etc. We should go into set-up after signposting rather than doing rebuttal first.  Rebuttal   * Good on real life skills - explain how this is non-exclusive. For instance, how is your side also able to teach this to students? * More studying - good on how you’ll deal with it later. * I think we need to challenge head on whether or not the implementation of holistic learning is as great as they claim it is. For instance, that this is not stressful, or that this is done with no real change to what students learn on the academic side. I know this is your first argument, but you should flag this up front.   Argument 1   * Good on challenging their framing - point out how this analysis flips their benefit of their first argument. * POI - good on how stress still exists. Explain how your side achieves the benefits on Prop whilst making school less stressful. For instance, that extra-curriculars exist, that hobbies exist, that these are comparatively more enjoyable on our side. * Spell out the impact of this argument!   Argument 2   * Good on how this changes. Can we explain what the harm of this is? * I get this happens, I want to know what the implication is!   05:09  We can spend more time on the positives of standardised testing! That it is a measurable way to assess student learning and hold schools accountable for their performance.  Let’s speak louder next time!  05:09 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Karin Yeung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Does our opening deal with the biggest question Alissa raises in her speech about the way in which she thinks standardised testing will manifest in real life? We need to start by flipping this framing!  Rebuttal   * Explain why specialisation is bad at such a young age; you can specialise at university, but when you’re young, you need to make sure you grow properly. Good on the kind of choices you have to make. Explain how high impact this is; what if you choose incorrectly? What happens then? Spell out the consequences. * POI: see comment above about making choices at a young age without full knowledge of yourself.   Argument 1   * Good on what universities want. We should unpack very clearly in set-up what the status quo is and how our world differs. We should also highlight what the problem with ST is - and what school looks like right now. How does holistic learning change the way school and classes and even college applications are centred. * We want to compare this to ST; holistic learning emphasises deep understanding and application of knowledge, fostering a lifelong love of learning. Standardised testing, with its focus on rote memorization, often leads to superficial understanding and quick forgetting after the test. Holistic approaches encourage exploration, inquiry-based learning, and project-based learning, leading to more meaningful and lasting learning experiences. This isn’t just about the increase in subjects, but also the methodology of teaching. * Good on present lack of focus - call out Alissa for framing this in the opposite way. Give me examples of how schools are actually too academic and ST focused rather than being so holistic as she claims in her speech. Unpack the uptightness you mention!   We should try to focus on sounding more persuaded by what we ourselves are saying; you’re trying to convince me to believe in you! Our volume has increased bit by bit which is great, but our tone still needs attention!  05:25  We need to ask POIs! | | | | | | |